

IN THE NAME OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

CONSTITUTIONAL COURT
OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

Judgment
of 15 July 2009 No. 13-П

in the case concerning the review of the constitutionality of Section 4, Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, and Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation in connection with a request of the Nizhegorodsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod and the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod.

Saint Petersburg, 15 July 2009

The Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation composed of Presiding Judge M. I. Kleandrov and Judges Yu. M. Danilov, L. M. Zharkova, G. A. Zhilin, V. D. Zorkin, S. M. Kazantsev, N. V. Melnikov, N. V. Seleznev, V. G. Strekozov,

in the attendance of Judge D. V. Karpov of the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod and a representative of the Council of the Federation Ye. V. Vinogradova, PhD in Law,

pursuant to Section 4, Article 125 of the Constitution of Russian Federation, Subsection 3, Section 1, Sections 3 and 4, Article 3, Subsection 3, Section 2, Article 22, Articles 36, 74, 86, 101, 102 and 104 of the Federal Constitutional Law “On the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation”,

in an open hearing, examined the constitutionality of Section 4, Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, and Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation.

The reason for the consideration of the case is requests of the Nizhegorodsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod and the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod. The ground for the consideration of the case is the discovered uncertainty of whether the provisions challenged by the applicant are in conformity with the Constitution of the Russian Federation.

Insofar as both requests concern essentially the same subject matter and pursuant to Article 48 of the Federal Constitutional Law “On the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation”, the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation is permitted to consider these applications together.

Having heard the report of Judge-Rapporteur S. M. Kazantsev, statements by the representatives of the parties, statements by representatives invited to participate in the hearing:

M. Y. Barshchevsky, Plenipotentiary Representative of the Government of the Russian Federation to the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation, V. N. Tkachev for the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation, A. A. Smirnov for the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation, T. A. Vasilyeva for the Office of the Prosecutor General of the Russian Federation, and having considered the written submissions and other materials, the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation

e s t a b l i s h e d :

1. According to Section 4, Article 29 of Law of the Russian Federation No. 1026-I, “On Police”, of 18 April 1991, if an injury or other damage to the health of a police officer is caused in connection with the performance of his service duties, a monetary compensation in the amount exceeding the pension granted on the grounds established by this Article shall be paid at the expense of the respective budget or the funds of the organization which concluded agreements with the police. Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation provides that damage caused to the life or health of an individual in the performance of contractual obligations as well as in the performance of military service duties, police service duties and other relevant obligations, shall be compensated under the rules of Chapter 59 of the Code except if the law or the contract establishes a higher level of responsibility.

The constitutionality of the mentioned provisions is challenged by the Nizhegorodsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod and the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod, which consider the civil actions lodged by a number of individuals against the Central Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation in the Privolzhsky Federal Circuit. The latter refused to pay the claimants monthly monetary payments of compensation for damage caused to their health during their performance of police service duty.

On 23 May 2002, S. L. Leonov was discharged from the internal affairs service because he had been recognized as having a limited ability to serve by the report of the military-medical commission, and in August 2002 he was recognized as having a 2nd degree disability due to a military trauma. Between 1 August 2004 and 31 July 2007 under the judgment of the Nizhegorodsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod, the Central Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation in the Privolzhsky Federal Circuit paid the applicant a monthly compensation for damage to health in the amount of 12,342 Russian rubles 67 kopecks. From 1 August 2007 the payments were terminated with reference to the opinion that the state is obliged to pay a police officer a compensation for the damage to health only if the damage was caused by guilty unlawful actions of the internal affairs authorities, other state authorities and their officials, however there was no guilt of the Central Department of the Ministry of Internal

Affairs of the Russian Federation in the Privolzhsky Federal Circuit in causing the damage to the health of S. V. Leonov.

By the judgments of 25 September 2003 and 29 January 2003, the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod recovered from the Central Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation in the Privolzhsky Federal Circuit a monthly monetary compensation for damage to health payable to V. I. Gorbovoy, who was discharged from the internal affairs service due to illness in April 2003 (on 21 September 2004 he was recognized as having a 2nd degree disability due to a military trauma). In October 2007, V. I. Gorbovoy was notified of the denial of further payments, and on 4 December 2007 during consideration of his civil action against the Central Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation in the Privolzhsky Federal Circuit the representative of the defendant disclaimed the action referring to changes in the judicial practice.

In November 2000, I. V. Filippov was discharged from the internal affairs service due to illness (on 1 December 2000 he was recognized as having a 3rd degree disability due to a military trauma). Under the judgments of the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod of 21 February 2002 and 10 June 2003 the applicant received a monthly monetary compensation for damage to health. From 1 April 2007 the Central Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation in the Privolzhsky Federal Circuit terminated indexing these payments, and in September 2007 notified him of a denial of further payments starting from 1 April 2008. The Central Department claimed that it had no guilt in causing damage to the health of this police officer. I. V. Filippov lodged another civil action with the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod aimed at recovery of a compensation for the damage to health. On 3 March 2008 the Somovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod rendered a decision to stay the proceedings on the civil case and to submit a request to the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation. On 13 May 2008 the Judicial Section for Civil Cases of the Nizhny Novgorod Regional Court annulled this decision having stated that all circumstances which are legally significant for proper resolution of the civil action could be established within the current civil proceedings and remitted the case to the first instance court for examination on the merits.

On 2 June 2008 A. N. Krapivin, who was discharged from the internal affairs service due to illness in December 2000 (in February 2001 he was recognized as having a 2nd degree disability due to a military trauma), lodged a civil action against the Central Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation in the Privolzhsky Federal Circuit with the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod aimed at recovery of a compensation for the damage to health. He had not raised the issue of payments before.

The Nizhegorodsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod and the Sormovsky District Court of Nizhny Novgorod believe that Section 4, Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, and Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation, within the meaning attributed in the judicial practice, violate the constitutional principles of a social state, everyone’s equality before the law and the court, everyone’s right to healthcare, the prohibition to adopt laws denying or derogating the rights and freedoms of man and citizen. Therefore, they contradict Articles 7, 19 (Sections 1 and 2), 41 (Section 1) and 55 (Section 2) of the Constitution of the Russian Federation. The mechanism of compensation for the damage caused to the health of internal affairs officers during the performance of their service duties established by the mentioned legal provisions, in the applicants’ opinion, places these officers in a disadvantageous position as compared to persons who receive the compensation for damage pursuant to the provisions of the Federal Law “On Mandatory Social Insurance of Labour-Related Accidents and Professional Diseases”, which provides for insurance coverage not only in the form of a lump-sum insurance payment, but also in the form of monthly insurance payments.

According to Articles 74, 101 and 102 of the Federal Constitutional Law “On the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation”, upon court requests the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation reviews the constitutionality of the challenged normative provisions to the extent that they shall be applied in the cases under consideration, with regard to the judicial practice and the place of the challenged provisions in the system of norms. Thus Section 4, Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, and Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation are the subject matter of the present proceedings in the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation to the extent that these provisions taken in conjunction regulate the relations with regard to compensation for the damage caused to the health of the police officers during the performance of their service duties.

2. Pursuant to the Constitution of the Russian Federation, in the Russian Federation state support of disabled persons is ensured and state pensions, allowances and other guarantees of social protection are established (Section 2, Article 7); the state guarantees equality of the rights and freedoms of man and citizen before the law and the court (Section 2, Article 19) and social security in connection with illness, disability and other cases prescribed by law (Section 1, Article 39). Accordingly, the Russian Federation as a social state is obliged to aspire to attain the maximum social effect in the sphere of health protection of citizens and compensation for the damage caused to them by injury or other damage to health during the performance of labour (official) activities. In order to achieve this goal the state shall use all necessary legal means, including institutions of private law (insurance, compensation for damage) and public law (state and social insurance, social security, monetary compensations).

Within the meaning of Article 37 (Section 1) of the Constitution of the Russian Federation taken in conjunction with its Articles 32 (Section 4), 72 (Subsection (b) Section 1) and 114 (Subsection (f)), the Russian Federation internal affairs service, through which the citizens exercise their right to labour, is a distinctive kind of government service directly related to the maintenance of public order, legality, securing the rights and freedoms of citizens, and, accordingly, it shall be performed in public interests. The mentioned definition was formulated by the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation in its Judgment No. 17-II of 26 December 2002. Persons performing this service carry out constitutionally significant functions which predetermine their legal status and the content and nature of the state duty in their respect. The obligations imposed on these persons imply the need to perform them under any circumstances including circumstances entailing significant risk to the life and health. Under Articles 1 (Section 1), 2, 7, 37 (Sections 1 and 3), 39 (Sections 1 and 2), 41 (Section 1), 45 (Section 1) and 71 (Subsection “c”) of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, the state has an obligation to guarantee them material support and compensation in case of damage to their life and health during the performance of this service.

Under this legal opinion, the state shall guarantee police officers compensation for damage caused to their health during the performance of their service duties in the amount which ensures maximum extent of compensation for the changing circumstances of their financial and (or) social status. At the same time, the nature of the functions performed by these persons, under the constitutional principles of fairness and proportionality, implies conditions of compensation for damage caused to them which are at least not worse than those established for other categories of citizens.

The constitutional obligation of the state to compensate for the damage caused to the health of police officers during the performance of their service duties may take place in various legal forms, including a) mandatory social insurance established to ensure social interests of these persons and public interests and which is financed from budgetary funds (Subsection 1, Article 969 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation; Federal Law No. 52-ФЗ, “On Mandatory Insurance of Life and Health of Military Servicemen, Citizens Called for Reserve Training, Enlisted and Commanding Servicemen of Internal Affairs Authorities of the Russian Federation, State Fire Service, Drug and Psychotropic Substances Control Authorities, and Employees of Institutions and Bodies of the Penitentiary System”), b) civil law (delict) compensation for damage caused to the health of a citizen during the performance of police service duties (Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation), c) lump-sum allowance and monetary payments (Sections 3 and 4, Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”).

2.1. Pursuant to the Civil Code of the Russian Federation (Subsections 2 and 3, Article 927, Subsection 1, Article 935, Subsection 1, Article 969), persons listed in it may be obliged to insure the life and health of other persons mentioned in the law against damage to their life and health (mandatory insurance). Moreover, the law may provide for mandatory insurance of the life and health of citizens who are state officials of certain categories, at the expense of the funds allocated from the respective budget (mandatory state insurance). The legal regulation of mandatory insurance of citizens against damage to life and health during the performance of labour duties and mandatory state insurance of the life and health of officers shall be exercised with regard to the special features of work under a labour contract and public, including law-enforcement, service.

For servicemen and persons equated to them, including police officers, the issues mentioned above are regulated by a special law, the Federal Law “On Mandatory Insurance of the Life and Health of Military Servicemen, Citizens Called for Reserve Training, Enlisted and Commanding Servicemen of Internal Affairs Authorities of the Russian Federation, State Fire Service, Drug and Psychotropic Substances Control Authorities, and Employees of Institutions and Bodies of the Penitentiary System”. Pursuant to the mentioned Federal Law, if an insured person is recognized as having a disability during the performance of his service or within one year after the discharge from the service due to injury (wound, trauma, contusion) or illness, which was sustained during the performance of the service, the federal body of executive power in which he served shall pay a lump-sum insurance payment in the amount determined by the monthly remuneration, which includes monthly emolument for a permanent position and a monthly emolument for a special rank, calculated on the day of payment and depending on the degree of disability (Subsections 1 and 2, Article 5).

The relations concerning mandatory social insurance of employees who may sustain damage to their life and health during the performance of their duties under a labour contract are regulated by Federal Law No. 125-Φ3, “On Mandatory Social Insurance of Labour-Related Accidents and Professional Diseases”, of 24 July 1998. According to this Federal Law the employer provides an employee, who works under a labour contract, with an insurance against labour-related accidents and professional diseases in the form of insurance payments (a lump-sum insurance payment and monthly insurance payments to the insured person), as well as in the form of payment for additional expenses related to medical, social and professional rehabilitation of the insured person injured in an insured accident (Article 8). Lump-sum insurance payment is effected in the amount determined by the degree of lost labour capacity of the insured person with regard to the maximum amount prescribed by the Federal Law “On the Budget of the Social Insurance Fund of the Russian Federation” for the regular fiscal year (Article 11). The amount of a

monthly insurance payment is defined as a share of the average monthly earnings of the insured person calculated according to the degree of loss of his labour capacity (Article 12).

Therefore, by its nature, sources, conditions, amount and order of payment, the system of mandatory state insurance of the life and health of servicemen and enlisted men, including police officers, is substantially different from the system of mandatory social insurance of employees against labour-related accidents and professional diseases. Consequently, the absence of a certain element in one of the systems may not in itself be considered as a defect, let alone a discrimination on the ground of profession.

2.2. The civil law institution of delict obligations is aimed at regulating relations concerning the causing of damage, including damage caused to the health of a person during the performance of labour or service activities. As a rule, an obligation to compensate for damage is a measure of civil law responsibility. This measure is applied to a person who caused damage, if *corpus delicti* is present (the event of damage, unlawfulness of the persons' conduct, causal relations between unlawful conduct and the event of damage, and the guilt of the person).

Pursuant to Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation, a damage caused to the life or health of an individual during the performance of police service duties shall be compensated under the rules of Chapter 59 (Articles 1064–1101) of the Code except if the law or the contract establishes a higher level of responsibility. This provision taken in conjunction with Article 1064 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation, which establishes common grounds of responsibility for damage, and Article 1069, according to which damage caused by unlawful actions (inaction) of state authorities or their officials shall be compensated at the expense of the respective bodies, guarantees compensation for damage caused to the life and health of a police officer under Chapter 59 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation at the expense of the respective budget, if the guilt of the state authorities or their officials is established. If there is no guilt of the state authorities or their officials in causing damage to life and health, an obligation to compensate for damage shall not be imposed on the state.

Accordingly, Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation does not preclude, and, on the contrary, prescribes full compensation by the state for the damage caused to the health of a police officer during the performance of his service duties. This compensation is a measure of civil law responsibility of state authorities or their officials as persons causing damage.

2.3. Pension security of citizens, including those who became disabled due to injury to health caused by the performance of labour or official duties, is intended to compensate for the lost earnings (monetary remuneration) and shall be provided with consideration of the differences in

the legal status of persons who work under labour contracts and servicemen and enlisted men, including police officers.

The disability pension for individuals who became disabled in the course of their labor activity is granted under Federal Law No. 173-ΦЗ, “On Labour Pensions in the Russian Federation”, of 17 December 2001; the size of this pension depends *inter alia* on the degree of lost labour capacity, the sum of nominal pension capital of the insured person, the presence or absence of dependants.

The disability pension granted to privates and commanding officers of the internal affairs service is calculated on the basis of monetary remuneration of these persons with consideration of the post emoluments, special ranks (without regard to increase in emoluments for service in remote or mountainous territories and other special conditions) and the percentile increase for long service, including payment of indexation of monetary remuneration. The procedure of calculation is established by Law of the Russian Federation No. 4468-I, “On Pension Security of Persons who Performed Military Service, Service in the Internal Affairs Authorities, the State Fire Service, Drug and Psychotropic Substances Control Authorities, Institutions and Bodies of the Penitentiary System, and Their Families”, of 12 February 1993. The size of the disability pension is differentiated depending on the degree and the cause of disability. Moreover, in addition to a disability pension supplement allowances are granted: a) for care for persons with the 1st degree of disability or disabled persons having the 3rd degree loss of the labour capacity the supplement is granted in the amount of 100 percent of the nominal pension calculated as a base share of the old-age labour pension, and b) to unemployed persons with the 1st or 2nd degree disability with dependent unemployed members of the family the supplement is granted in the amount between 32 and 100 percent of the nominal pension depending on the number of dependent family members.

2.4. Persons holding the positions of privates and commanding officers in the internal affairs service, who are recognized as disabled persons due to wounds, contusions or injuries sustained during the performance of service duties, and other disabled persons under Article 28¹ of Federal Law No. 181-ΦЗ, “On Social Protection of Disabled Persons in the Russian Federation”, of 24 November 1995 have the right to monthly monetary payment in the amounts differentiated according to the degree of lost labour capacity.

A citizen may request to transfer a certain share of the monthly monetary payment for payment for a set of social services, which are considered state social assistance and include additional medical assistance (including supply of prescription drugs, sanatorium and health resort treatments), free use of suburban railway transport, and free interurban transport to and

from the place of treatment (Chapter 2, Federal Law No. 178-ФЗ, “On State Social Assistance”, of 17 July 1999).

Presidential Decree No. 887, “On Measures to Improve the Financial Situation of Persons Disabled due to Military Trauma” of 1 August 2005 establishes that as of 1 September 2005 citizens of the Russian Federation who have been recognized, in the established procedure, disabled due to military trauma, shall receive monthly material allowances in the amount of 1,000 Russian rubles payable in addition to the pensions and other payments.

According to Federal Law No. 5-ФЗ, “On Veterans”, of 12 January 1995 the privates and commanding officers of the internal affairs service disabled due to a wound, contusion, injury or disease sustained or developed during the performance of service duties in the combat areas are recognized as persons disabled in combat (Article 4). These persons acquire the right to discounts and allowances concerning rent payments and utilities, medical treatment, the receipt and use of leaves, admission to educational institutions of professional education and payment of scholarships, priority installation of a home phone line, in case of working under a labour contract or conducting other activities requiring mandatory social insurance, full payment of a temporary loss of labour capacity allowance regardless of the length of service, priority admission to care facilities for seniors or disabled persons, social services centers, social service departments providing care at the place of residence (Subsection 1, Article 14). These measures of social support apply both to privates and commanding officers of the internal affairs service disabled due to a wound, contusion or injury sustained during the performance of their service duties (Subsection 3, Article 14).

2.5. Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police” stipulates that if during the performance of his service duties a police officer sustains injuries precluding him from further performance of service he shall be paid: a) a lump-sum allowance in the amount of a five-year monetary remuneration at the expense of the respective budget, and subsequently these funds shall be recovered from the guilty person (Section 3), and b) a monetary compensation in the amount exceeding the pension granted on the grounds established by this Article to be paid at the expense of the respective budget or the funds of the organization which concluded an agreements with the police (Section 4).

Pursuant to the Instruction “On the procedure of compensating for damage in case of death or infliction of injury to an internal affairs service officer and damage caused to the property of an officer of the internal affairs service and his loved ones” adopted by Order of the Minister of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation of 15 October 1999 No. 805, a monetary compensation for the damage caused to health shall be paid to the injured officer of the internal affairs service monthly upon granting him a disability pension due to these injuries, other

damage to health sustained during the performance of service duties (in relation to the performance of service duties) and which led to premature discharge from the internal affairs service due to disease or medical restrictions. The compensation for damage shall be paid by the finance department (accounting department) of the respective internal affairs service authority during the whole period of disability (Subsections 21 and 23).

The provision of Section 4, Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, within its literal meaning, is an additional social protection guarantee established by this special statute for police officers. Consequently, this guarantee falls outside the scope of civil obligations arising as a consequence of causing damage. A monetary compensation ensured by this provision is payable monthly on the sole basis of damage (injury or other damage to health), which occurred during the performance of service duties by a police officer. It is payable even if there is no guilt of the state authorities or their officials in causing this damage.

Accordingly, within the system of legal regulation in force Section 4, Article 29 the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, implies that the state pays police officers a monthly monetary compensation for the damage caused by injury or other damage to health in connection with the performance of their service duties if this damage precludes further performance of the service. In this case, the state undertakes to pay compensation for damage as an authority acting in public interests. Pursuant to the legal opinion articulated by the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation in Decision No. 523-O of 27 December 2005, the state establishing a system of compensations acts neither as an insurer nor as a person causing damage nor as a debtor in delict obligation but as a public authority which expresses common interests and as an administrator of the budget formed and performed in the common interests.

Any other interpretation of Section 4, Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, would lead to a violation of Articles 7, 19 and 39 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation. These Articles imply the need to provide police officers with conditions of compensation for damage caused to life and health during the performance of service duties which are at least not worse than those for citizens working under a labour contract. At the same time, the differences in the sources, conditions, order and amount of compensation for this damage caused to the mentioned categories of citizens may not be regarded as discriminatory or unjustifiably restricting the rights of police officers.

However, as follows from the law-enforcement practice which has established in the recent years, the law-enforcement authorities referring to Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation refuse to pay police officers a monthly monetary compensation as a redress for damage caused by injury or other damage to health during the performance of their service

duties if this damage precludes them from further performance of service, if there were no guilty unlawful actions of internal affairs authorities, other state authorities, or their officials.

Such an interpretation of Section 4, Article 29 of the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police” taken in conjunction with Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation leads to disproportionate restriction of police officers’ rights, does not comply with the constitutional principles of a social state, everyone’s equality before the law and the court. Further, it contradicts the legal nature of compensatory payments, which shall be effected in cases where the system of valid legal means does not provide for compensation for damage to the appropriate extent *inter alia* by civil law recovery from third parties including persons who committed offences causing damage to life and health.

Concluding from the above and pursuant to Article 6, Sections 1 and 2 of Article 71, Articles 72, 74, 75, 79, 80 and 100 of the Federal Constitutional Law “On the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation”, the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation

h e l d :

1. To recognize Section 4, Article 29 the Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, as conforming to the Constitution of the Russian Federation to the extent that within its constitutional meaning and taken in conjunction with Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation it implies that the state shall pay monthly monetary compensation to police officers as a redress for damage caused by injury or other damage to health in connection with the performance of service if this damage precludes them from further performance of the service.

The constitutional meaning of the mentioned provisions established in the present Judgment precludes any other interpretation in the law-enforcement practice.

2. To recognize Section 4, Article 29, Law of the Russian Federation “On Police”, as non-conforming to the Constitution of the Russian Federation, its Articles 7, 19 and 39, to the extent that, in conjunction with Article 1084 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation within the meaning attributed to them in the law-enforcement practice, it allows the law-enforcement authorities to deny payment to police officers of a monthly monetary compensation as a redress for damage caused by injury or other damage to health during the performance of their service duties when this damage precludes them from further performance of the service, if the guilty unlawful actions of the internal affairs authorities, other state authorities or their officials are not present.

3. This Judgment shall be final and shall not be subject to any appeal, it shall come into force immediately upon pronouncement, shall be directly applicable, and shall not require confirmation by other authorities and state officials.

4. Pursuant to Article 78 of the Federal Constitutional Law “On the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation”, this Judgment shall be immediately published in the Collection of Laws of the Russian Federation, *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*. The Judgment shall also be published in the Bulletin of the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation.

Constitutional Court
of the Russian Federation

No. 13-II